of a sex determination gene, *Masculinizer* (responsible for male-specific splicing of *dsx* and repression of transcription from Z chromosomes), has been similarly attributed to misregulation of dosage compensation (*33*).

Dosage compensation in A. gambiae also relies on hyperactivation of the X-chromosome genes in males (34). Therefore, in the presence of YOB, dosage compensation may be directly or indirectly induced in the XX embryos, leading to their death as a result of abnormal overtranscription from both X chromosomes (fig. S10). Conversely, in the absence of YOB, lack of dosage compensation and concomitant insufficient transcription from the X chromosome should be male-lethal, rather than leading to feminization of the XY individuals. Indeed, we observed highly significant male deficiency in mosquitoes surviving transient knockdown of Yob in nonsexed embryos (Fig. 3C). All tested female survivors had the XX karyotype.

Involvement of the Y chromosome factor in sex determination in Anopheles was first supported by the finding of a single, triploid Anopheles culicifacies male with the XXY sex chromosomes (15). Such a karyotype, apparently extremely rare and not reported elsewhere in numerous mutational and cytogenetic studies in Anopheles, seems to counter overtranscription of the X-chromosome genes as a cause of female embryo lethality observed in our study. However, the genetic background of this male must have been severely compromised through the mutagenic effects of irradiation on his parents (15). It thus seems likely that the XXY male may have carried multiple mutations, including those causing loss of function of dosage compensation machinery that allowed his survival to adulthood despite possessing two X chromosomes.

A. gambiae and A. arabiensis are the most important African vectors of human malaria. Control of the disease depends heavily on the use of insecticides, but emergence of resistance in mosquito populations severely threatens the effectiveness of these approaches (35). The sterile insect technique and other genetic control methods have been proposed to complement current efforts to suppress mosquito populations (36, 37). Such programs must incorporate male-only releases, because released females would contribute to pathogen transmission. However, no effective methods to sex the large number of Anopheles needed for releases currently exist. The fitness and mating competitiveness of adults is highly dependent on larval density; therefore, removing females from the release generation during the embryonic stage would drastically decrease the costs of rearing of high-quality males (38). Yob represents an excellent tool to be used in transgenic technology to conditionally eliminate female embryos and efficiently produce male-only generations of both malaria-transmitting Anopheles species (37).

## REFERENCES AND NOTES

- 1. T. Gempe, M. Beye, BioEssays 33, 52-60 (2011).
- 2. A. S. Wilkins, BioEssays 17, 71-77 (1995).
- T. W. Cline, B. J. Meyer, Annu. Rev. Genet. **30**, 637–702 (1996).
  J. W. Erickson, J. J. Quintero, PLOS Biol. **5**, e332 (2007).

- 5. T. Hiroyoshi, Genetics 50, 373–385 (1964).
- 6. D. Bedo, G. Foster, Chromosoma 92, 344-350 (1985).
- U. Willhoeft, G. Franz, *Genetics* 144, 737–745 (1996).
  J. J. Stuart, G. Mocelin, *Genome* 38, 673–680
- (1995).
- A. Pane, M. Salvemini, P. Delli Bovi, C. Polito, G. Saccone, Development 129, 3715–3725 (2002).
- 10. C. Concha, M. J. Scott, Genetics 182, 785-798 (2009).
- 11. M. Hediger et al., Genetics 184, 155–170 (2010).
- 12. J. N. Shukla, S. R. Palli, Sci. Rep. 2, 602 (2012).
- I. Marín, B. S. Baker, Science 281, 1990–1994 (1998).
  M. J. D. White, Animal Cytology and Evolution (Cambridge Univ.
- Press, Cambridge, ed. 3., 1973).
- 15. R. H. Baker, R. K. Sakai, J. Hered. 70, 345-346 (1979).
- 16. A. B. Hall et al., Science 348, 1268-1270 (2015).
- C. Scali, F. Catteruccia, Q. Li, A. Crisanti, J. Exp. Biol. 208, 3701–3709 (2005).
- Materials and methods are available on Science Online.
  J. Krzywinski, D. R. Nusskern, M. K. Kern, N. J. Besansky, Genetics 166, 1291–1302 (2004).
- 20. A. B. Hall et al., BMC Genomics **14**, 273 (2013).
- A. B. Hall et al., Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 113, E2114–E2123 (2016).
- 22. J. Juhn, A. A. James, Insect Mol. Biol. 15, 363–372 (2006).
- 23. D. Tautz et al., Nature **327**, 383–389 (1987)
- 24. D. K. Pritchard, G. Schubiger, Genes Dev. 10, 1131–1142 (1996).
- W. H. Li, in *Molecular Evolution*, W. H. Li, Ed. (Sinauer, Sunderland, MA, 1997), pp. 177–214.
- F. Criscione, Y. Qi, R. Saunders, B. Hall, Z. Tu, *Insect Mol. Biol.* 22, 433–441 (2013).
- 27. J. C. Lucchesi, T. Skripsky, Chromosoma 82, 217-227 (1981).
- 28. J. P. Gergen, Genetics 117, 477-485 (1987).
- A. Hilfiker, H. Amrein, A. Dübendorfer, R. Schneiter, R. Nöthiger, Development 121, 4017–4026 (1995).

 J. C. Lucchesi, W. G. Kelly, B. Panning, Annu. Rev. Genet. 39, 615–651 (2005).

- 31. M. E. Gelbart, M. I. Kuroda, Development 136, 1399-1410 (2009).
- 32. G. J. Bashaw, B. S. Baker, Cell 89, 789-798 (1997).
- 33. T. Kiuchi et al., Nature 509, 633-636 (2014).
- 34. G. Rose et al., Genome Biol. Evol. 8, 411-425 (2016).
- 35. J. Hemingway et al., Lancet **387**, 1785–1788 (2016).
- 36. E. F. Knipling, *Science* **130**, 902–904 (1959). 37. L. Alphey, *Annu. Rev. Entomol.* **59**, 205–224 (2014).
- 38. P. A. Papathanos *et al.*, *Malar. J.* **8** (suppl. 2), S5 (2009).

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank H. Ranson, A. Wilson, and anonymous reviewers for comments and L. Revuelta for technical assistance. This study was supported by funds from the Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine (LSTM), an MRC-LSTM Research Studentship, Wellcome Trust grant 089045/Z/09/Z (J.K. and G.J.L.), and funds from the Pirbright Institute (J.K.). Transgenic mosquitoes used for sexing were developed with Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council grant BB/7021933/1 (G.J.L.). J.K. was partly supported by a subcontract CRSC120816JKUND of the NIH contract HHSN272200900039C. The RNA-sequencing data have been deposited in the Sequence Read Archive repository under the accession numbers SRR953486.1 and SRR953487.1.

## SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

www.sciencemag.org/content/353/6294/67/suppl/DC1 Materials and Methods Figs. S1 to S10 Tables S1 to S3 References (39–48)

28 February 2016; accepted 1 June 2016 10.1126/science.aaf5605

# **CLIMATE CHANGE**

# Sex-specific responses to climate change in plants alter population sex ratio and performance

William K. Petry,<sup>1,2\*†</sup> Judith D. Soule,<sup>2</sup> Amy M. Iler,<sup>2,3</sup> Ana Chicas-Mosier,<sup>2,4</sup> David W. Inouye,<sup>2,5</sup> Tom E. X. Miller,<sup>6</sup> Kailen A. Mooney<sup>1,2</sup>

Males and females are ecologically distinct in many species, but whether responses to climate change are sex-specific is unknown. We document sex-specific responses to climate change in the plant *Valeriana edulis* (valerian) over four decades and across its 1800-meter elevation range. Increased elevation was associated with increased water availability and female frequency, likely owing to sex-specific water use efficiency and survival. Recent aridification caused male frequency to move upslope at 175 meters per decade, a rate of trait shift outpacing reported species' range shifts by an order of magnitude. This increase in male frequency reduced pollen limitation and increased seedset. Coupled with previous studies reporting sex-specific arthropod communities, these results underscore the importance of ecological differences between the sexes in mediating biological responses to climate change.

**D** ifferences between the sexes in morphology and physiology can result in sex-specific responses to the environment (*I*-3). Given this, climate change may affect the sexes differently, potentially creating an imbalance in the frequency of males and females and altering patterns of fertility and population dynamics (4–6). In so doing, climate change might ameliorate or exaggerate existing sex ratio biases, alternatively driving population growth or decline (4, 7) and affecting the ability of species' ranges to track shifting climate envelopes (8, 9).

We investigated whether climatic variation differentially affects the performance of the sexes

and whether these differences are sufficient to bias population sex ratios. We studied *Valeriana edulis* (valerian, Caprifoliaceae), a dioecious herb with fixed, genetically based sex expression (*10, 11*), over its entire elevation range from arid lowelevation scrublands to mesic alpine tundra (2000 to 3790 m) and in response to 33 years of climate change. We assessed (i) sex ratio change along these two complementary axes of climate variation, (ii) the sex-specific mechanisms underlying this change, and (iii) how biased sex ratios influence individual fitness.

Climate varies considerably across the elevation range of *V. edulis* (fig. S1, A to D, and table S2). Contemporary climate data for our study area in the Rocky Mountains of Colorado (fig. S2 and table S1) showed that increasing elevation is accompanied by a decrease in mean growing season (June-August) temperature (-0.59°C per 100 m), an increase in growing season precipitation (1.5 mm per 100 m), a delay in the date of snowmelt (4.1 days later per 100 m), and a marginally significant trend for increasing growing season soil moisture (1.09% per 100 m). Collectively, these changes produce a gradient of decreasing aridity with increasing elevation.

We surveyed population operational sex ratios (OSRs; the proportion of flowering individuals that are male) across this elevation gradient to test whether elevational variation in climate was accompanied by parallel variation in V. edulis population OSR. Surveys of 31 V. edulis populations across the species' elevation range in 2011 showed that males decrease in frequency with increasing elevation (linear regression,  $F_{1, 29} = 10.33$ ,  $P = 0.003, R^2 = 0.26$ ) (Fig. 1A), falling from 50.0% of flowering individuals at the lowest elevation population to 22.7% at the highest population, for an average change of -0.88% per 100 m of elevation. Spatial climatic variation thus affects V. edulis OSR, suggesting that similar shifts may occur in response to climate change over time.

Recent climate change has warmed and dried our study area, driving climatic isoclines up in elevation and providing a temporal axis of cli-

<sup>1</sup>Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Irvine, CA 92697-2525, USA. <sup>2</sup>Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory, Crested Butte, CO 81224, USA. <sup>3</sup>Aarhus Institute of Advanced Studies, Aarhus University, Høegh-Guldbergs Gade 6B, DK-8000 Aarhus C, Denmark. <sup>4</sup>Department of Integrative Biology, Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, OK 74078, USA. <sup>5</sup>Department of Biology, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742, USA. <sup>6</sup>Department of BioSciences, Program in Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, Rice University, Houston, TX 77005, USA. \*Corresponding author. Email: william.petry@usys.ethz.ch †Present address: Institute of Integrative Biology, EHH Zürich (Swiss Federal Institute of Technology), Universitätstrasse 16, Zürich, Switzerland. mate variation that parallels that which occurs over the elevation gradient (fig. S1, E to H, and table S2). Data collected during the growing season over the past four decades (1978-2014) show that mean temperature increased 0.21°C/ decade, precipitation decreased 1.91 mm/decade, and soil moisture decreased 1.5%/decade, whereas snowmelt date marginally advanced 2.9 days/ decade (tables S1 and S2). This change over time is equivalent to an upslope shift in the isoclines for growing season mean temperature, precipitation, advancement of snowmelt, and soil moisture at rates of 36  $\pm$  8, 133  $\pm$  26, 72  $\pm$  40, and 195  $\pm$ 523 m/decade (±SEM), respectively. Climate change over the past four decades has advanced the onset of flowering in V. edulis by 3.1 days/decade (linear regression, P = 0.062,  $R^2 = 0.091$ ) (fig. S3), likely because of an advancing date of snowmelt, which is strongly associated with flowering phenology in this species (linear regression, P < 0.0001,  $R^2 =$ 0.47) (12). Regional climatic projections suggest that climate will continue to change (13).

Recent climate change has in turn significantly shifted V. edulis OSR in a manner consistent with the upslope shift in climate. Surveys of OSR from nine populations in both 1978 and 2011 showed that males have become more frequent across the species' elevation range at a rate of 1.28%/decade (paired t test,  $t_9 = 2.29$ , P = 0.047) (Fig. 1B). Comparing this temporal shift with the independent, parallel pattern of OSR variation over space shows that OSR isoclines are moving upslope at a rate of 175 m/decade (lower SE = 87 m/decade, upper SEM = 316 m/decade), mirroring the rates at which precipitation and soil moisture have changed. The parallel changes in OSR over elevation and time implicate climate as the driver of OSR variation but do not reveal the processes by which this occurs.

To explore the mechanisms underlying sexspecific responses to climate change, we quantified life history differences between the sexes in four populations spanning 1167 m of elevation (2470 to 3637 m) and varying 22% in





OSR (48 to 26% male). We used sex- and sizestructured rates of annual growth and mortality collected from 1978–1980 to calculate male and female life expectancy upon reaching reproductive maturity in each population. This metric integrates sex differences in demographic performance across the life span and reflects the average duration during which a plant contributes to OSR. Sex differences in reproductive life expectancy were concordant with population OSR, so that female-biased OSRs were associated with longer reproductive life spans than those of males (fig. S4) and suggesting that sexspecific effects of climate on life history drive population variation in OSR.

We sought to determine the proximate, physiological basis for the sex-specific effects of climate by focusing on water, a key resource. A plant's water use efficiency (WUE; carbon assimilation per unit of water transpiration) mediates its ability to acquire energy within the short, waterlimited growing season (fig. S5). We hypothesized that sex differences in WUE-a trait known to differ between the sexes in many plant species, likely resulting from higher costs of reproduction in females (14)-underlie sex differences in plant performance and drive patterns in OSR. We measured the integrated WUE of each sex as indicated by leaf carbon isotope ratios collected from eight populations varying in OSR (15). Sex differences in WUE strongly predicted population OSR (Deming regression,  $t_6 = 2.06$ , P = 0.043) (Fig. 2); females had higher WUE than that of males in strongly female-biased populations (low OSR), but males had higher WUE than that of females in populations with a higher proportion of males (higher OSR). Although these findings do not directly link WUE to differential performance of the sexes, in other species this trait drives sex differences in performance that produce intrapopulation variation in OSR among arid and mesic microsites (16).

Variation in OSR may feed back to affect population growth by altering pollen availability and seedset rates (7, 17). We measured the response of female seedset to an index of pollen availability



Fig. 2. Sex differences in WUE predict OSR. Each point represents a single population (n = 8 populations; 2470 to 3637 m). WUE is inferred from <sup>13</sup>C fractionation ( $\Delta$ ), and positive differences between the sexes ( $\Delta$ F –  $\Delta$ M) indicate that WUE of females is lower than that of males and vice versa. Data are means ± SEM.



-160

0

OSR

1800

Fig. 3. Pollen availability limits female reproductive success. Each point represents one focal female controlling for competition with neighboring females for pollen. Estimated mean pollen availability for the range of contemporary OSRs observed across the V. edulis elevation range and expected OSRs in the year 2100 are indicated by the shaded regions where labeled points ("A" to "D") graphically show the expected change in pollen availability and seedset at the species' range margins. A linear model was fit to logit-transformed data; the back-transformed model fit is shown (12).

Contemporary pollen limitation

9Ó0

Pollen availability index

.

1.0-

Proportion seedset

0.5

.

0.0+0

within the range of pollen movement (12). The majority (~90%) of pollen was received from males within 10 m of focal females (fig. S6). Female seedset in turn increased with pollen availability in this mating neighborhood (Fig. 3), rising from 39.3 to 99% of flowers producing seed across the observed range of neighborhood pollen availability. Simulating the effect of population OSR on seedset across the range of observed OSRs (Fig. 1A and supplementary materials, materials and methods), we found that the observed spatial variation in OSR was sufficient to alter female fitness. The low frequency of males at high elevation (22.8%) reduced median pollen availability by 55% compared with low-elevation populations with balanced OSR, corresponding to a reduction in seedset from 95 to 76% (Fig. 3). The demographic consequences of these effects are unclear because population growth rate in long-lived species is often relatively insensitive to changes in seed production (18). Nevertheless, V. edulis disperses only by seed, and climate effects on seedset may thus have important consequences for range shifts.

A mechanistic understanding of OSR dynamics in this system enables projections of the future state of V. edulis populations. Assuming the rate of increase in male frequency continues (1.28%/decade) (Fig. 1B), pollen limitation of reproduction at high-elevation populations could be halved by the year 2100 (a median seedset increase of 11.2%) (Fig. 3), facilitating the upslope range expansion of this species. In contrast, increasing male frequency at low elevation could have little effect on seedset (+2.6%) because females in those populations are pollensaturated under contemporary, balanced OSRs (Fig. 3). Instead, increasingly male-biased OSRs at low elevation may threaten population viability



60

No. species ranges

120

by replacing females with males and thus reducing population-level seed production (7). Moreover, our previous work shows that female V. edulis support dramatically higher densities of arthropods than do males, including several specialist herbivores that depend exclusively on V. edulis (19, 20). Accordingly, the effects of a climatedriven decline in female frequency may extend to higher levels of ecological organization.

Our data are distinctive in that they provide a pace of trait change (the upslope shift in plant sex distributions), whereas past studies of distribution responses to climate change have focused on species range shifts. Although trait changes are predicted to occur more rapidly than range shifts (21, 22), the magnitude of such differences is hitherto unknown. Previously reported rates of species range shifts in montane plants show a mean upslope shift of 11.1 m/ decade (12), which is dramatically slower than the 175 m/decade upslope pace of OSR change in V. edulis (Fig. 4). The pace of species range shifts frequently lags behind the pace of climate change (12), and such range disequilibria are frequently attributed to dispersal limitation (23). In contrast, shifts in traits within species ranges may track climate change more closely because they are based on differential performance of genetically based types that often already exist in many populations across the range. Here, we show that the pace of OSR change in V. edulis tracked climate change; it has kept pace with shifts in precipitation and soil moisture and has exceeded those of temperature and snowmelt (fig. S1).

We have demonstrated the occurrence of a potentially widespread form of biological response to climate change. We show that sex specificity of these responses can be exceptionally rapid, with broad effects across multiple scales of ecological organization. Within populations, sex-specific responses to climate change can skew sex ratiosthrough sex differences in physiology and performance or otherwise (5, 9, 24)—and the resulting sex ratio biases may, by mediating reproduction, affect population growth rate, the risk of population extinction, and the rate of adaptation to changing climate by altering the effective population size (25, 26). In so doing, climatedriven changes in sex ratio may also control the tempo of species range shifts by mediating mate limitation at the leading or trailing range margins (8, 9). Accordingly, a full understanding of biological responses to climate change requires a multiscale approach that integrates the underlying, but often cryptic, changes in intraspecific traits that give rise to higher-order patterns.

## **REFERENCES AND NOTES**

- 1. M. A. Geber, T. E. Dawson, L. F. Delph, Gender and Sexual Dimorphism in Flowering Plants (Springer, 1999).
- R. Lande, Evolution 34, 292-305 (1980).
- 3 R. Shine, O. Rev. Biol. 64, 419-461 (1989)
- J.-F. Le Galliard, P. S. Fitze, R. Ferrière, J. Clobert, Proc. Natl. 4. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 102, 18231-18236 (2005).
- J. M. Calabrese et al., J. Anim. Ecol. 77, 746-756 (2008). 6. A. O. Shelton, Ecology 89, 3020-3029 (2008).
- H. Caswell, D. E. Weeks, Am. Nat. 128, 707-735 (1986). 7
- T. E. X. Miller, B. D. Inouye, Ecol. Lett. 16, 354-361 (2013). 8.
- T. E. X. Miller, A. K. Shaw, B. D. Inouye, M. G. Neubert, Am. Nat. 9 177. 549-561 (2011)
- 10. O. Meurman, Soc. Sci. Fennica. Commentationes Biologicae II 2, 1-104 (1925).
- 11. J. D. Soule, thesis, Michigan State University, East Lansing (1981). 12. Materials and methods are available as supplementary
- materials on Science Online. 13. E. P. Maurer, L. Brekke, T. Pruitt, P. B. Duffy, Eos Trans. AGU 88. 504-504 (2007)
- 14. T. E. Dawson, M. A. Geber, in Gender and Sexual Dimorphism in Flowering Plants, M. A. Geber, T. E. Dawson, L. F. Delph, Eds. (Springer, 1999), pp. 175-216.
- 15. G. D. Farquhar, J. R. Ehleringer, K. T. Hubick, Annu. Rev. Plant
- Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 40, 503-537 (1989). 16. K. R. Hultine, S. E. Bush, A. G. West, J. R. Ehleringer, Oecologia
- 154, 85-93 (2007). 17. T. M. Knight et al., Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst. 36, 467-497
  - (2005).
- 18. M. Franco, J. Silvertown, Ecology 85, 531-538 (2004).
- 19. W. K. Petry et al., Ecology 94, 2055-2065 (2013). 20. K. A. Mooney, A. Fremgen, W. K. Petry, Arthropod-Plant
- Interact. 6, 553-560 (2012) 21. J. Thompson et al., Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 110, 2893-2897 (2013).
- 22. J. R. Etterson, R. G. Shaw, Science 294, 151-154 (2001).
- 23. J. P. Sexton, P. J. McIntyre, A. L. Angert, K. J. Rice, Annu. Rev.
- Ecol. Evol. Syst. 40, 415-436 (2009).
- 24. Y. E. Morbey, R. C. Ydenberg, Ecol. Lett. 4, 663-673 (2001).
- 25. B. Charlesworth, Nat. Rev. Genet. 10, 195-205 (2009).
- 26. D. J. Rankin, H. Kokko, Oikos 116, 335-348 (2007).

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are grateful to the Rocky Mountain Biological Laboratory for facilitating this research over several decades. We are indebted to K. Perry and numerous field and laboratory assistants for data collection and processing; to b. barr, J. Thomson, and J. Harte for snowmelt data; to N. Morueta-Holme for species range data; to T. Huxman for assistance with stable isotope analyses; and to P. CaraDonna for his invaluable comments on a previous draft. Funding sources for this multidecade research are listed in the supplementary materials. Data for this study have been deposited in Dryad (DOI: 10.5061/dryad.1cf8p).

### SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

www.sciencemag.org/content/353/6294/69/suppl/DC1 Materials and Methods Supplementary Text Figs. S1 to S8 Tables S1 to S5 References (27-60)

14 January 2016; accepted 16 May 2016 10.1126/science.aaf2588



Sex-specific responses to climate change in plants alter population sex ratio and performance William K. Petry, Judith D. Soule, Amy M. Iler, Ana Chicas-Mosier, David W. Inouye, Tom E. X. Miller and Kailen A. Mooney (June 30, 2016) *Science* **353** (6294), 69-71. [doi: 10.1126/science.aaf2588]

Editor's Summary

# **Changing sex ratios**

Climate-warming temperatures might be expected to affect the sex ratio of species if sex determination is temperature-dependent. Petry *et al.* show that indirect climate effects could also alter sex ratios in species in which sex is genetically determined and damage reproductive fitness (see the Perspective by Etterson and Mazer). Over four decades, sex ratios in populations of a dioecious alpine plant have shifted toward females as a result of the different water needs of the male and female plants. The lack of males has reduced the reproductive success and fitness of the females. Similar subtle differences between sexes in environmental sensitivities could eventually lead to population declines.

Science, this issue p. 69; see also p. 32

This copy is for your personal, non-commercial use only.

Article Tools	Visit the online version of this article to access the personalization and article tools: http://science.sciencemag.org/content/353/6294/69
Permissions	Obtain information about reproducing this article: http://www.sciencemag.org/about/permissions.dtl

*Science* (print ISSN 0036-8075; online ISSN 1095-9203) is published weekly, except the last week in December, by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. Copyright 2016 by the American Association for the Advancement of Science; all rights reserved. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS.